

**BEFORE THE ENVIRONMENTAL APPEALS BOARD
UNITED STATES ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY
WASHINGTON, D.C.**

In Re:	:	
	:	
	:	Permit Appeal
Penneco Environmental Solutions, LLC	:	UIC 23-01
	:	
	:	
UIC Permit No. PAS2D702BALL	:	
	:	
	:	
	:	

MOTION FOR LEAVE TO FILE SUR-REPLY TO PETITIONERS’ OMNIBUS REPLY

On April 29, 2024, the Petitioners in this Appeal filed their Omnibus Reply to Region 3’s and Penneco Environmental Solutions’ Responses to the Petition (“Reply”). The Region seeks the Board’s permission to file a Sur-Reply in response. The Reply makes three new arguments that were not made in the Petition.

The three arguments are as follows:

1. The Region failed to follow the requirements of two Executive Orders issued by President Biden that require Federal Government Agencies to account for Environmental Justice factors in carrying out their duties. Reply at 9–12.
2. The Region did not make the administrative record available during the public comment period. Reply at 14.
3. The Region may not have considered a notice from the Permittee that the well was not suitable for injection when the Region issued the Final Permit. Reply at 6–7.

The Petitioners did not make these arguments in the Petition and only make them now in their Reply. 40 C.F.R. § 124.19(c)(2) restricts replies by prohibiting them from raising new

arguments or issues. Where new arguments are raised in opposing reply briefs, the Board, as a remedy, typically allows sur-replies. *In re Essroc Cement Corp., RCRA Appeal No. 13-03* at 1 (EAB Sept. 25, 2013).

Additionally, the Board allows sur-replies where further briefing would assist the Board in resolving disputed claims. Because the Petitioners have raised three new arguments and to fully inform the Board about these arguments, the Region seeks to the Board's approval to file the accompanying Sur-Reply.

The undersigned has contacted counsel for the Petitioners and the Permittee concerning this motion. Counsel for the Petitioners represents that they oppose this motion. Counsel for the Permittee represents that it supports the motion.

Respectfully submitted,
/s/ Philip Yeany

*(signed per Revised EAB Order re: Electronic Filing
in non-Part 22 Proceedings, 8/12/13)*
Philip Yeany
Senior Assistant Regional Counsel
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency, Region III
1600 John F. Kennedy Boulevard
Philadelphia, Pennsylvania 19103
Phone: (215) 814-2495
Email: Yeany.Philip@epa.gov

Of Counsel:
Katie Spidalieri
Water Law Office
Office of General Counsel
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
William Jefferson Clinton North Building
Office 7308B
202-564-4138
Email: Spidalieri.Katie@epa.gov